

Review article

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Environment International



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/envint

Toxicity evolution of triclosan during environmental transformation and human metabolism: Misgivings in the post-pandemic era



Na Luo ^{a,b,1}, Jia Chen ^{a,b,1}, Xiaoyi Chen ^{a,b}, Mei Wang ^{a,b}, Xiaolin Niu ^{a,b}, Guanhui Chen ^{a,b}, Chuyue Deng ^{a,b}, Yanpeng Gao ^{a,b,*}, Guiying Li ^{a,b}, Taicheng An ^{a,b}

 ^a Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Joint Laboratory for Contaminants Exposure and Health, Guangdong Key Laboratory of Environmental Catalysis and Health Risk Control, Institute of Environmental Health and Pollution Control, Guangdong University of Technology, Guangzhou 510006, China
^b Guangzhou Key Laboratory of Environmental Catalysis and Pollution Control, Key Laboratory of City Cluster Environmental Safety and Green Development of the Ministry of Education, School of Environmental Science and Engineering, Guangdong University of Technology, Guangzhou 510006, China

ARTICLE INFO

Handling Editor: Olga Kalantzi

Keywords: Triclosan Environmental and human exposure Metabolism Environmental transformation Health effect

ABSTRACT

In the context of pandemic viruses and pathogenic bacteria, triclosan (TCS), as a typical antibacterial agent, is widely used around the world. However, the health risks from TCS increase with exposure, and it is widespread in environmental and human samples. Notably, environmental transformation and human metabolism could induce potentially undesirable risks to humans, rather than simple decontamination or detoxification. This review summarizes the environmental and human exposure to TCS covering from 2004 to 2023. Particularly, health impacts from the environmental and metabolic transformation of TCS are emphasized. Environmental transformations aimed at decontamination are recognized to form carcinogenic products such as dioxins, and ultraviolet light and excessive active chlorine can promote the formation of these dioxin congeners, potentially threatening environmental and human health. Although TCS can be rapidly metabolized for detoxification, these processes can induce the formation of lipophilic ether metabolic analogs via cytochrome P450 catalysis, causing possible adverse cross-talk reactions in human metabolic disorders. Accordingly, TCS may be more harmful in environmental transformation and human metabolism. In particular, TCS can stimulate the transmission of antibiotic resistance even at trace levels, threatening public health. Considering these accruing epidemiological and toxicological studies indicating the multiple adverse health outcomes of TCS, we call on environmental toxicologists to pay more attention to the toxicity evolution of TCS during environmental transformation and human metabolism.

1. Introduction

There is a global increase in the production and utilization of antibacterial agents, especially in the context of pandemic viruses and pathogenic bacteria (Amigun Taiwo et al. 2022; Dhama et al. 2021). Triclosan [5-chloro-2-(2,4-dichlorophenoxy)phenol], (TCS), as a representative broad-spectrum antimicrobial agent, can effectively inhibit the activity of bacteria, fungi, and viruses. TCS has been used for about 55 years and added to over 2,000 products, such as personal care products, medical supplies, and household goods (Halden Rolf et al. 2017; Rodricks et al. 2010). Global annual TCS production increased from 1,500 tons in 1998 to 4,762 tons in 2015 (Dar et al. 2022), with the USA consuming 132 million liters of TCS-containing products annually (Alfhili and Lee 2019). Humans are continuously exposed to TCS, primarily through skin/oral pathways (Rodrickset al. 2010), and the per capita consumption is approximately 1.3 mg/person/day (Zhao et al. 2013). In particular, the use of TCS increased significantly through the widespread use of hand sanitizer following the COVID-19 pandemic outbreak (Wang et al. 2022). Accordingly, the estimated maximum TCS intake in children increased to 2.791 mg/kg/day, significantly higher than the 0.3 mg/kg/day permitted daily dosage for adults from the United States Environmental Protection Agency (US EPA) (Wanget al. 2022). Alarmingly, increasing amounts of TCS are released into the environment, potentially causing harm to both the environment and

E-mail address: gaoyp2016@gdut.edu.cn (Y. Gao).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2024.108927

Received 26 April 2024; Received in revised form 30 July 2024; Accepted 31 July 2024 Available online 6 August 2024

0160-4120/© 2024 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/).

^{*} Corresponding author at: Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Joint Laboratory for Contaminants Exposure and Health, Guangdong Key Laboratory of Environmental Catalysis and Health Risk Control, Institute of Environmental Health and Pollution Control, Guangdong University of Technology, Guangzhou 510006, China.

 $^{^{1}\,}$ Both authors contributed equally to this work and were considered as co-first authors.

human health (Capdevielle et al. 2008; Milanović et al. 2023).

Although TCS-containing toothpaste can reduce plaque and gingivitis, the scientists have voiced concerns about the potential hazards of TCS use (Halden Rolfet al. 2017). Toxicological studies have shown that TCS causes adverse effects on reproduction, the endocrine system, the immune system, and muscle function, as well as genetic toxicity in aquatic organisms and higher vertebrates (Dhillon et al. 2015; Maharana et al. 2015; Solá-Gutiérrez et al. 2018). TCS can also accelerate the spread of antibiotic-resistance genes in the environmental microbiome, potentially causing severe public health concerns (Lu et al. 2022). Therefore, many countries have established regulations on TCS. In 2017, the European Commission banned TCS in human hygiene products (Zhang et al. 2019) and over-the-counter hand and body washes were prohibited by the United States Food and Drug Administration (FDA) in 2016 and 2017 (Skarha et al. 2019).

Antibacterial agents and antiseptic wash products are essential to control and prevent the spread of highly contagious viruses (Laue et al. 2024; Mukherjee et al. 2021). However, the overuse and disposal of TCS-containing disinfectants have raised concerns about adverse environmental and human health effects (Dhamaet al. 2021). A number of reviews on the occurrence, exposure, and toxicity of TCS in the environment and in humans have been published, providing crucial information on human exposure and toxicity (Daret al. 2022; Lee et al. 2024; Rehman et al. 2021). However, the potentially increase in toxicity during the transformation and metabolism of TCS can induce more adverse health effects (Ashrap et al. 2017; Zheng et al. 2008) and TCS toxicity evolution during environmental transformation and human metabolism has not been summarized. Hence, this review mainly focused on the environmental and health effects of TCS exposure,

particularly health concerns during its environmental transformation and human metabolism. Moreover, potential diseases involving TCS exposure were also summarized based on toxicological and epidemiologic studies. This review will further understanding of the potential adverse effects of TCS on human health during environmental occurrence, transformation, and human metabolism.

2. Methodology and bibliometric analysis

A systematic search was performed using the Web of Science core collection database from 2004 to 2023 (last search date 19 April 2024). The following search terms were used: "triclosan" AND "exposure* or human health or health effect*" AND "metaboli* or transformation or conversation or *degradation or photolysis or product*" AND "toxic* or adverse effect.*" Document types, such as books, patents, conference papers, meeting abstracts, case reports, dissertation theses, and correction additions, were excluded from this review. A total of 659 papers written in English were identified.

The number of papers on this topic has increased dramatically in 20 years (Fig. 1A). The major keywords and similarities of all papers were identified through network analysis using VOS viewer software (version 1.6.18.0). A total of 3,546 keywords and 52 keywords met the criteria (occurring more than 20 times). These keywords were grouped into five clusters (Fig. 1B), and the top five keywords in each cluster are listed in Fig. 1C. The listed keywords are mainly related to similar contaminants (Group 1), sample types (Group 2), transformation (Group 3), and adverse effects (Group 4). Accordingly, all publications were further split into four categories: exposure, transformation and metabolism, toxicology, and toxicity evolution. Most studies (42 %) focused on the



Fig. 1. (A) The number of published papers per year from 2004 to 2023. (B) The percentage of papers by category. (C) Network analysis of keywords from retrieved papers. (D) Top five keywords in the four clusters. (E) Keyword groupings (represented by symbols: ▼◆■▲).

toxicological study of TCS. In contrast, studies regarding the "toxicity evolution" of TCS accounted for only 19 % (Fig. 1D), indicating that more attention should be paid to this field in the future.

3. Environmental and human exposure

Humans are mainly exposed to TCS through dermal absorption from TCS-containing personal care products (Ao et al. 2017). Drinking water, food, dust, and the atmosphere can also be sources of human exposure to TCS (Weatherly and Gosse 2017), which are summarized in Table S1. The global concentration of TCS in surface water ranges from 1 to 40,000 ng/L (Daret al. 2022). Wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs) are important control measures to prevent TCS from polluting the environment. However, TCS cannot be removed entirely from WWTPs, which are one of the major sources of surface water pollution (Kumar et al. 2010; Montaseri and Forbes 2016). Furthermore, the resulting solid waste from WWTPs could become recurring biosolids; the agricultural availability of these biosolids containing TCS presents a potential risk for human dietary exposure via ingestion of agricultural products (Dhillonet al. 2015). TCS can be further incorporated into crop plants (such as carrots and soybeans) via sewage sludge application (Macherius et al. 2012; Wu et al. 2010). The presence of TCS in indoor air has received limited attention, because TCS with low volatility in the atmosphere is nearly undetectable (Aoet al. 2017; Canosa et al. 2007; Fan et al. 2010; Geens et al. 2009). However, TCS as a relatively lipophilic compound can be absorbed in airborne particulate matter, which has been detected in numerous sites including offices, apartments, day nurseries, and houses (Laborie et al. 2016), and is also present in settled dust from kitchens, bedrooms, and living rooms (Tran et al. 2020). Despite the relatively low human health risk from TCS from these sources, a more comprehensive risk assessment based on the multiple exposure pathways of TCS is needed (Zhang and Lu 2023).

TCS has been found in human urine, breast milk, blood, and nails (Chen et al. 2023; Sandborgh-Englund et al. 2006), including adipose tissue, cord blood, and amniotic fluid from clinical specimens (Goodman et al. 2018). Table S2 summarizes the concentrations of TCS in various human biological samples. Differences in TCS concentrations may be due to consumer product consumptions, behavioral, and dietary patterns (Kim et al. 2020): lifestyles vary in different regions, especially the usage habits of TCS-containing cosmetics. A global analysis of urine samples found that TCS exposure is significantly higher in high-income regions than in developing regions (Zhang and Lu 2023). However, taking age into account, among Korean adults aged 18-69 years, the urinary TCS concentration was highest in participants aged 60-69 years $(2.2 \times 10^3 \text{ ng/L})$ (Kim et al. 2011). In Belgium, the urinary TCS concentration of participants aged 20–39 years (range from 1.86-598.95 imes10³ ng/L) (Pirard et al. 2012). Regarding gender, females are the major consumers of personal care products, and they are potentially the highexposure population. In fingernail samples from China, TCS levels were higher in females than in males (Yin et al. 2016). However, in a survey on blood serum TCS concentrations from an Australian population, males had significantly higher concentrations than the females (Allmyr et al. 2008). These conflicting results suggest that population-based reports exploring potential factors influencing TCS exposure should be studied in greater depth, including sex, age, living habits, and socioeconomic status.

Furthermore, pregnant and lactating women with physiological and metabolic changes are special populations closely related to fetal and infant exposure, vital to their development. TCS was first detected in breast milk in Sweden in 2002, and in three out of five samples ranged from < 20 ng/g to 300 ng/g (Adolfsson-Erici et al. 2002). Breast milk from 36 mothers was tested in Stockholm, with TCS concentrations of 0.95 ng/g in the exposed groups compared with 0.35 ng/g in the control group (Allmyr et al. 2006). In California and Texas, TCS concentrations in breast milk from 62 samples ranged from 0 to 2,100 ng/g (Dayan 2007). Notably, exclusively breast-fed infants excreted higher amounts

of TCS with infants in whom a mixed diet was introduced, which might be attributed to the transmission of TCS to infants through breastfeeding from exposed mothers (Frederiksen et al. 2022). However, there is a 6,500-fold safety margin between the exposure levels obtained in correlative studies and the maximum TCS concentration, inducing any adverse effects on humans (Dann and Hontela 2011). Therefore, there is no definite evidence that the small amounts of TCS in breast milk pose risks for infants. Notably, the limited studies have reported that the concentration level of TCS in pregnancy urine is associated with decreased birth weight of born babies (Patti et al. 2021). Therefore, given that these susceptible populations might be influenced by adverse effects of TCS exposure, additional studies are needed to elucidate the link between exposure and potential human health outcomes. Moreover, TCS metabolism can influence TCS exposure, triggering a potentially synergistic exposure of TCS and its metabolites in humans. Concerning these potential risks, the toxicity of TCS in the process of metabolic transformation needs to be critically determined.

4. Toxicity in metabolism and environmental transformation

TCS in the environment can be gradually removed by photodegradation and biodegradation (Amigun Taiwoet al. 2022). Several toxic products are formed during the transformation of TCS, such as the formation of dioxin analogs under ultraviolet irradiation and methyl-TCS generated from aerobic digestion. These products can migrate into the environment, where humans could be exposed to them. Additionally, TCS and its products enter the human body through various exposure pathways, including oral mucosa, respiratory tract, digestive tract, and skin (Ashrapet al. 2017). These synergistic processes result in potentially adverse effects on organisms and human health (Cochran et al. 2024; Gao et al. 2021). Therefore, this section summarizes the toxicity evolution of TCS in metabolism and environmental transformations to uncover the potential harm to humans.

4.1. Toxicity in human metabolism

TCS is considered non-persistent in the body and can be quickly absorbed, metabolized, and eliminated (Goodmanet al. 2018). A human pharmacokinetic study found that the plasma concentration of TCS rapidly increased after ingestion of an oral solution containing 4 mg TCS, peaked within 1–3 h, and was excreted within hours (Sandborgh-Englundet al. 2006). Further, an statistical study has shown that the halflife of TCS in plasma is 10–15 h for rats, 8–12 h for mice, and 25–32 h for hamsters, while in humans, the metabolic half-life is 13–16 h for children and 15–29 h for adults (Bagley and Lin 2000; Bedoux et al. 2012; DeSalva et al. 1989; Siddiqui and Buttar 1979). These results suggest the metabolism of TCS in organisms and the metabolic cycle of TCS is species dependent. Although TCS can be gradually eliminated by the human body, it also slightly accumulates in organs through blood circulation (Milanovićet al. 2023).

Evidence from 11 patients showed that TCS could be detected in the liver and adipose during the autopsy, with the highest concentration in the liver (3.14 ng/g) (Geens et al. 2012). The liver is the primary source of TCS metabolism, and these complex processes require the combined action of multiple enzymes, especially the cytochrome P450 enzyme system (CYP450) (Weatherly and Gosse 2017). CYP450 is a large family of heme-oxidized proteins of the monooxygenases, which play a crucial role in various physiological pathways such as synthesis and metabolism (Guengerich 2017). TCS can perform the hydroxylation and cleavage of the ether bond under CYP450 metabolism (Wu et al. 2017), part of phase I metabolism. The main metabolites of TCS, including multiple hydroxylated TCS, 2,4-dichlorophenol, and 4-chlorocatechol (Fang et al. 2010; Fang et al. 2014; Zhu et al. 2018), have been detected in mouse liver, bile, and feces, as well as plasma and urine, hydroxylated TCS was also identified in human feces samples (Zhang et al. 2021b). Notably, chlorophenols are catalogued as one of the priority pollutants according

to the US EPA because of their toxicity and potential carcinogenicity (Ferreiro et al. 2021). Moreover, hydroxylated TCS is recognized as a reactive metabolite (Liu et al. 2020), and its toxicity should be taken seriously (Zhanget al. 2021b). These metabolites can be covalently modified on multiple proteins, including hormone response (ten proteins), immune system process (eight proteins), and inflammatory response (seven proteins), suggesting endocrine and immune systems may be disrupted (Liuet al. 2020).

Furthermore, TCS also can produce TCS-O-TCS through the phase I metabolic CYP450 in perch, quail, mice, and human microsomes. The lipophilic metabolite TCS-O-TCS has been detected in urine samples from the general population (Ashrapet al. 2017). Meanwhile, some new lipophilic ether metabolic analogs, including TCS-O-bisphenol A, TCS-O-benzo(a)pyrene, and TCS-O-estradiol, have been found in mice and humans, formed by the reaction of TCS and other substances (such as phenolic xenobiotics and endogenous metabolites) via CYP450 catalysis (Ashrapet al. 2017; Liu et al. 2022). This mentioned metabolic reaction is a widespread pathway for TCS, inducing possible adverse cross-talk reactions in organisms. The hepatocarcinogenic potential of TCS is related to the activation of the constitutive androstane receptor (CAR) (Yueh et al. 2014). Alarmingly, these above-mentioned lipophilic ether metabolites may exhibit higher biological activity than the parent compounds. The CAR activity of TCS-O-TCS is about 7.2 times higher than that of TCS (Ashrapet al. 2017), potentially interfering with the metabolism of other carcinogens (such as diethylnitrosamine) and increasing the susceptibility to tumorigenesis (Yuehet al. 2014). These lipophilic ether metabolites can also affect metabolic toxicity, significantly reducing the levels of endogenous vitamin E and disturbing endocrine homeostasis (Liuet al. 2022). Furthermore, the increase of reactive oxygen species (ROS) levels during TCS metabolism can exacerbate the downregulation of endogenous antioxidants and lipid peroxidation, posing considerable risks to human health (Peng et al. 2019).

TCS and hydroxylated TCS can undergo phase II metabolism via glucuronidation and sulfonation (Zhanget al. 2021b). These metabolites have been widely detected in human HepG2 cells (Wuet al. 2017), liver microsomes or cytosol (Wang et al. 2004), urine (Provencher et al. 2014), serum (Zhanget al. 2021b), and skin (Fanget al. 2014). In human liver, TCS-glucuronide was the main metabolite at 20 μ M exposure dose, while exposure to dose below 1 μ M led to sulfonation, generating TCS-sulfate (Penget al. 2019). Therefore, human exposure to TCS might interfere with major metabolic pathways. Compared with the human

liver, human skin has a low ability to metabolize TCS: in 24 h, the skin metabolized approximately 3 % of TCS exposure dose, and TCS-sulfate was the only metabolite in the skin up to 8 h after application (Fanget al. 2014). However, TCS-glucuronide is excreted faster from HepG2 cells than TCS-sulfate (Zhanget al. 2019), and the metabolites of TCS-glucuronide and TCS-sulfate have more polarity, thus enhancing their water solubility, and therefore excretion (Weatherly and Gosse 2017). However, one concern about these metabolites is the potential regeneration from circulating the conjugates to TCS and hydroxylated TCS, due to deconjugation enzymes (Ginsberg and Rice Deborah 2009). Another concern is that intestinal flora affects the conversion of these metabolites into free TCS (Zhang et al. 2022). Potential reabsorption of TCS and hydroxylated TCS would occur by the liver, in a process known as "enterohepatic circulation," delaying the elimination of toxicants from the body (Claus et al. 2016).

Overall, TCS undergoes metabolize during phase I and II metabolism and forms more polar metabolites. The metabolic mechanism of TCS is summarized in Fig. 2. The toxicological effects of metabolites generated from phase I metabolism are greater than those from phase II metabolism. Notably, the disruption of endogenous metabolite homeostasis by CYP450 catalysis should be studied in the future as it implies a disorder of the metabolic system, posing a potential risk to human health.

4.2. Toxicity in environmental transformation

In the environment, TCS can be converted into various degradation products via biotransformation, photolysis, oxidation, and chlorination, as summarized in Fig. 3. During photodegradation of TCS in aquatic environments, one of the main products from TCS cyclization is 2,8dichlorodibenzo-P-dioxin (2,8-DCDD) (Gao et al. 2014; Mezcua et al. 2004; Sanchez-Prado et al. 2006). Significantly, in excessive active chlorine (such as disinfection and seawater environments), TCS can be transformed into more dioxin congeners via cyclization after TCS chlorination, including 1,2,8-TCDD, 2,3,7-TCDD, 1,2,3,8-TCDD, and 2,3,7,8-TCDD (Buth et al. 2009; Wu et al. 2019). Ultraviolet light can also promote the formation of these dioxin congeners (Wuet al. 2019). Once dioxin congeners in the environment enter the body, they are stored due to their chemical stability and last a long time (Buth et al. 2010). Dioxin is a potent multisite carcinogen (Zhenget al. 2008), with chronic exposure causing several types of cancer in animals (Berg 2006). Exposure to dioxin congeners causes severe damage to human beings and animals,



Fig. 2. Metabolic mechanism of triclosan.



Fig. 3. Environmental transformation products of triclosan.

inducing disruption of the nervous, immune, reproductive, and endocrine systems (Marinković et al. 2010; Neel and Sargis 2011).

Furthermore, under conditions of sunlight or chlorination, TCS can also transform to produce toxic substances, such as 2,4-dichlorophenol and 2,4,6-trichlorophenol (Solá-Gutiérrez et al. 2020). 2,4-dichlorophenol is formed from the cleavage of the ether link in TCS and then undergoes chlorination of the phenolic ring to form 2,4,6-trichlorophenol (Iovino et al. 2019). Both are known endocrine disruptors that potentially cause cancer, congenital disabilities, and developmental diseases, and have been flagged as priority pollutants in the USA (Dann and Hontela 2011). TCS also reacts with free chlorine to produce chloroform, which might happen in the processes in household dish soap usage (Tsai et al. 2008). Chloroform has been linked to liver and kidney toxicity and mild teratogenicity (Fiss et al. 2007). It is worth noting that the chlorinated derivatives of TCS are significantly more toxic than TCS itself, and these chlorinated derivatives are often precursors of dioxins (Fig. 3) (Buthet al. 2009; Wuet al. 2019).

In wastewater treatment, up to 60 % of TCS is bio-transformed, and approximately 7.4 % of TCS is converted to methyl-TCS by aerobic digestion (Chen et al. 2011; Tohidi and Cai 2017). Methyl-TCS can reduce growth inhibition of microorganisms and avoid the formation of UV-driven dioxins (Farré et al. 2008). However, methyl-TCS is more persistent than TCS in the environment (Lozano et al. 2013). For example, the half-life of methyl-TCS (104 d) in soil is four times that of TCS (443 d) (Lozano et al. 2012). Methyl-TCS is more hydrophobic; therefore, it can accumulate more easily in organisms (Balmer et al. 2004; Coogan et al. 2007). Several studies have reported that methyl-TCS has potential ecological toxicity, including inducing cytotoxicity in hemocytes (the immune cells of mollusks) (Gaume et al. 2012) and impacting the embryonic development of zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) and sea urchin (Paracentrotus lividus) (Macedo et al. 2017). Considering the limited ecotoxicological data on methyl-TCS, more detailed assessments are warranted.

In the atmosphere, previous field monitoring has indicated that the photochemical conversion of TCS could result in the formation of gaseous polychlorinated dibenzodioxin and polychlorinated dibenzofuran, such as 2,7/2,8-DCDD (Friedman et al. 2012). Moreover, photonitrification will produce nitro compounds and other photo-toxic substances. In brief, TCS in the atmosphere can react with HONO, leading to the formation of 2,4-dichlorophenol, which can be further oxidized by nitrous acid to generate 2,4-dichloro-6-nitrophenol and 5-chloro-2nitrophenol (Ma et al. 2017). These products are photo-toxic and harmful to organisms and humans in the rain and atmosphere (Maet al. 2017). Evidence has proven that 2,4-dichloro-6-nitrophenol is an endocrine-disrupting chemical, resulting in developmental toxicity of aquatic organisms, such as Chinese rare minnow embryos (Chen et al. 2017). Furthermore, 2,4-dichloro-6-nitrophenol can also induce hypertrophy of hepatocytes, inhibit of spermatogenesis, and the degeneration of oocytes (Chen et al. 2016).

These environmental transformation products of TCS may have higher degradation resistance and toxicity than their parent compound. The transformation products may pose a greater health risk to humans, which deserves more attention in future research.

5. Adverse health effects involved from TCS exposure

Numerous studies have proven the toxicity of TCS in many organisms, both in vivo and in vitro, using animal and cell models (Kumar et al. 2021; Rehmanet al. 2021). These toxicological mechanism studies provide data support for epidemiology. Notably, although these toxicological conclusions are described around TCS, the results presented here suggest that there may be combined adverse effects of TCS and its metabolites. Therefore, based on epidemiological and toxicological studies, the following section briefly summarizes the adverse health effects and potential diseases involved of TCS. Fig. 4 illustrates the adverse health effects currently documented by TCS.

TCS is an endocrine-disrupting chemical with multiple interference mechanisms, including disrupting hormone metabolism, displacing hormones from hormone receptors, and disrupting steroidogenic enzyme activity (Wang and Tian 2015). Moreover, reproductive disruption is considered one of the most critical potential effects of TCS (Milanovićet al. 2023). TCS exhibits antagonistic effects on sex hormones, thyroid hormones, and glucocorticoids (Kenda et al. 2020; Kolšek et al. 2015; Paul et al. 2010), while an agonist effect of TCS is also observed on sex hormones (Huang et al. 2014). In luciferase reporter gene assays in cells, TCS promotes the estrogen response and suppress the androgen response, suggesting that the estrogenic/ androgenic effects of TCS may be mediated via the signaling pathways involving estrogen/androgen receptors (Chen et al. 2007; Kolšeket al. 2015; Rodríguez and Sanchez 2010). Furthermore, TCS also can compete with the thyroid hormone thyroxine for binding to transthyretin (Hamers et al. 2020). However, epidemiological studies have not shown proofpositive evidence that TCS can affect the thyroid hormone system in humans (Berger et al. 2018; Derakhshan et al. 2019; Guo et al. 2020a). Although some studies have found a negative correlation between TCS and thyroxine, the evidence for a positive correlation with stimulating thyroid hormone is still limited (Braun et al. 2018). The reduction mechanism of thyroxine may be due to the up-regulation of metabolismrelated enzymes induced by TCS metabolism, including CYP450, glucosyltransferase, and sulfotransferase (Paul et al. 2012; Paulet al. 2010; Zorrilla et al. 2009).

Studies have shown that interference with thyroid hormones, estrogen signaling, androgen activity, and the hypothalamic-pituitary axis may further induce adverse human health outcomes, related to birth, reproduction, and puberty in girls (Goodmanet al. 2018; Krause et al. 2012). Epidemiological studies have shown that TCS exhibits a small inverse association with pubic hair stage, indicating a potential relationship between TCS exposure and pubertal development in girls (Wolff Mary et al. 2010). Significantly, increased levels of TCS were found in children with a low development quotient and the mothers of fetuses with malformations (Guo et al. 2020b; Wei et al. 2017). Gestational TCS exposure is also negatively associated with infant birth weight (Aker et al. 2019; Etzel et al. 2017; Huo et al. 2018; Pattiet al. 2021); however, prenatal TCS exposure may not affect early-childhood growth (Wu et al. 2018). Adverse associations between gestational TCS exposure and placental steroidogenic enzyme concentration levels have also been found, inducing more vulnerable reproductive development of the male fetus (Wang et al. 2018). These results may explain the shortened anogenital distance in a Danish 3-month-old boy with prenatal exposure to TCS (Lassen et al. 2016).

In addition to their impact on hormones, TCS adversely affects immune and inflammation functions in humans (Rees Clayton Erin et al. 2011). For example, TCS can mediate the downregulation of proinflammatory factors at the cellular level, such as prostaglandin E2, cyclooxygenase, interleukin, and leukotrienes (Rehmanet al. 2021). TCS can also increase the intracellular Ca^{2} + concentration and induce lymphocyte membrane hyperpolarization. Since changing the membrane potential of lymphocytes affects cellular immune function, TCS may adversely affect the human immune system (Kawanai 2011). Several epidemiological studies have suggested that TCS exposure may increase the risk of specific asthma and allergen sensitization (Rees Clayton Erinet al. 2011; Spanier et al. 2014), which might be due to a cellular imbalance caused by a disturbance in the body's microbes (Okada et al. 2010). However, some reports did not find a relationship between TCS and total immunoglobulin E (IgE) levels (Savage et al. 2012). Therefore, there is still a lack of consistent evidence on the effect of TCS on the incidence of immune diseases, such as allergies and asthma.



Fig. 4. Adverse health effects of triclosan, including endocrine disrupting effects, human immunity, reproductive disruption, carcinogenicity, and metabolic disease.

TCS has also been associated with cancer development. In earlier studies, TCS has been shown to induce hypertrophy and vacuolation of rodents hepatocytes mediated through the peroxisome proliferation activating receptor α (PPARα) (Rodrickset al. 2010). Further long-term exposure experiment studies reported that TCS could stimulate hepatocyte proliferation and the fibrotic response, accompanied by oxidative stress. Importantly, TCS, as a liver tumor promoter, significantly accelerates the development of hepatocellular carcinoma (Yuehet al. 2014). TCS also induces liver-free fatty acid synthesis by up-regulating fatty acid intake and fat. These changes in lipid homeostasis may lead to membrane instability, lipid accumulation, oxidative stress, and inflammation. TCS exposure may induce liver lipid metabolism disorders, further aggravating the liver damaging effect of TCS (Huang et al. 2020). Another study reported that TCS could increase basal calcium levels in human prostate cancer stromal cells through direct activation of membrane ion channels, which would induce the release of vascular endothelial growth factor and significantly impact prostate carcinogenesis (Derouiche et al. 2017).

TCS exposure can also cause other problems, such as oxidative stress, obesity, and osteoporosis (Binelli et al. 2009; Cai et al. 2019; Li et al. 2015). The effects of TCS on oxidative stress have been reviewed previously (Rehmanet al. 2021). Epidemiological studies on the relationship between TCS and obesity/ osteoporosis may represent isolated findings, lacking the consistency of similar studies. In summary, increasing evidence indicates that TCS exposure may have adverse effects on human health. This review focuses on endocrine disruption, adverse effects on human immune and inflammation functions, and carcinogenicity. These results also remind us to pay more attention to the safety and human impacts of TCS.

6. TCS exposure: Misgivings in the post-pandemic era

Since the COVID-19 pandemic outbreak, TCS-containing disinfecting cleaning products have been increasingly consumed. In UK alone, the sales of hand soaps surged by 102 % (Chirani et al. 2021) while the proportion of consumers using hand sanitizers rose to 89.9 % in South Korea (Choi et al. 2021). In people using TCS-containing gel sanitizers, the TCS intake through hand-to-mouth exposure is twice as high as before the COVID-19 pandemic (Wanget al. 2022). However, this does not apply to countries or regions that have prohibited TCS added to certain types of soaps. Environmental and human exposure levels of TCS have already shown a significant downtrend in the USA (Adhikari et al. 2022; Han et al. 2016; Kim et al. 2021). Surprisingly, despite 21.3 % of hand sanitizers in China containing TCS, a significantly higher percentage compared to countries such as India, Brazil, Nigeria, the UK, and the USA, and the Arab Emirates (Wanget al. 2022), the internal exposure level to TCS in southern China has increased following the pandemic. For instance, in 2021, the mean concentration of TCS in adult urine was reported to be 14.2 ng/mL (Tian et al. 2023), which is significantly higher compared to the pre-pandemic concentration of 1.87 ng/mL in the same region (Zhang et al. 2021a). Unfortunately, there are no more experimental data and evidence to prove and explain the above trend, that is, that human exposure to TCS has decreased overall. We speculate that these phenomena may be due to increased consumer self-awareness of the adverse effects of TCS. However, continuous human exposure to TCS in the post-pandemic era, health hazards remain unknown due to the metabolism and environmental transformation of TCS.

TCS in healthcare products has not been prohibited in countries other than the USA and the European Union (Daret al. 2022). In Canada, continuous annual detection from 2012 to 2018 of surface water has found a general increase in TCS concentration (Lalonde et al. 2019). Consequently, the sustained consumption of TCS in non-controlled regions could lead to the increased TCS in the environment. Alarmingly, TCS can promote the development of antibiotic resistance, threatening public health (Lu et al. 2018), even at trace TCS concentrations (Martin et al. 2020). TCS-induced bacteria extend their resistance to antibiotics

by acquiring antibiotic-resistance genes via horizontal gene transfer (Lu et al. 2020). These conjunction transfers mediated by TCS are primarily related to excessive oxidative stress and increased membrane permeability (Luet al. 2022). The relative abundance of antibiotic-resistance genes [erm(X), a 23S rRNA methyltransferase implicated in resistance to several antibiotics] in house dust is linked to the TCS concentration (Hartmann et al. 2016). TCS can even mediate the conjunction transfer of the RP4 plasmid to opportunistic human pathogens (Legionella spp, a common cause of severe pneumonia in community settings) (Fields et al. 2002), potentially resulting in serious public health risks (Luet al. 2022). However, after TCS exposure ceased, the antibiotic tolerance of the adapted cells declined over time, revealing that reduced TCS release may mitigate the propagation of antibiotic resistance (Li et al. 2019). Nonetheless, the threshold concentration of TCS, the sensitive microbial populations, an evaluation of the degree of horizontal gene transfer, and the breakthrough time point for triggering pathogenic evolution remain unclear. Especially, TCS transformation can occur in environmental microbial consortia (Yin et al. 2022), even in intestinal microbiota (Zhang et al. 2023). highlighting the importance of risk assessment for the spread of antimicrobial resistance in microbiota during TCS transformation.

7. Conclusions and future perspectives

The vast global presence of TCS in the environment and in humans suggests a large-scale and potentially global contamination trend. Especially in the context of pandemic viruses and pathogenic bacteria, human exposure to TCS could increase rapidly. There are currently limited toxicological assessments of TCS during environmental transformation and human metabolism. Existing studies have observed that the human body can rapidly metabolize TCS, and the metabolic process might cause adverse health effects. Environmental transformations aimed at detoxification also lead to the formation of carcinogenic dioxins. Accordingly, despite accruing epidemiological studies on TCS, the adverse effects on human health during environmental transformation and human metabolism of TCS remain unclear. The following suggestions are necessary for future research:

- 1) Extensive toxicological studies and assessment of toxicity evolution. Existing studies have reported that TCS has multiple toxic effects. However, the evolution of these toxic effects in various transformation pathways remains largely unknown. Particularly the human metabolism of TCS may trigger a chain reaction of signaling pathways. Therefore, it is urgent to conduct extensive and effective research on the human health impacts of TCS metabolism.
- 2) Identification and quantification of toxic transformation products. It is very important to identify the toxic transformation products of TCS and individually assess the toxicity of these products. Furthermore, considering the toxic effects associated with exposure dose, these toxic products of TCS transformation should be monitored quantitatively monitored.
- 3) Relationship between toxic mechanisms and potential adverse health outcomes. Existing adverse effects of TCS in humans mainly focus on two aspects: the toxicological mechanisms and epidemiology. Although several studies on the mechanisms of TCS toxicity have guided the adverse health outcomes in humans, the available information is still limited, which is crucial for the adequate protection of human health. Namely, further investigations into the relationship between toxic mechanisms and potential adverse health outcomes are urgently needed.
- 4) Synergistic effect between microbial metabolism and development of antibiotic resistance to TCS. Reversible antibiotic resistance to TCS and its resistance mechanisms have been revealed. Considering TCS transformation in microbes, the synergistic effect between microbial metabolism and the development of antibiotic

N. Luo et al.

resistance for TCS should be determined for public health assessments of TCS.

Fundings sources

We thank the National Key Research and Development Program of China (2022YFC3105600 and 2019YFC1804500), National Natural Science Foundation of China (41977365 and 42277222), Postdoctoral Fellowship Program of CPSF (GZC20230566), Guangdong Basic and Applied Basic Research Foundation (2023B1515020078 and 2023A1515110370), and Local Innovative and Research Teams Project of Guangdong Pearl River Talents Program (2017BT01Z032).

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Na Luo: Writing – review & editing, Writing – original draft, Methodology, Formal analysis, Data curation. Jia Chen: Writing – original draft, Investigation, Formal analysis, Data curation. Xiaoyi Chen: Investigation, Formal analysis. Mei Wang: Investigation, Formal analysis. Xiaolin Niu: Investigation, Formal analysis. Guanhui Chen: Investigation, Formal analysis. Chuyue Deng: Investigation, Formal analysis. Yanpeng Gao: Writing – review & editing, Supervision, Project administration, Funding acquisition, Conceptualization. Guiying Li: Supervision, Conceptualization. Taicheng An: Supervision, Conceptualization.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Data availability

Data will be made available on request.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2024.108927.

References

- Adhikari, S., Kumar, R., Driver, E.M., et al., 2022. Mass trends of parabens, triclocarban and triclosan in Arizona wastewater collected after the 2017 FDA ban on antimicrobials and during the COVID-19 pandemic. Water Res. 222, 118894.
- Adolfsson-Erici, M., Pettersson, M., Parkkonen, J., et al., 2002. Triclosan, a commonly used bactericide found in human milk and in the aquatic environment in Sweden. Chemosphere 46, 1485–1489.
- Aker, A.M., Ferguson, K.K., Rosario, Z.Y., et al., 2019. The associations between prenatal exposure to triclocarban, phenols and parabens with gestational age and birth weight in northern Puerto Rico. Environ. Res. 169, 41–51.
- Alfhili, M.A., Lee, M.-H., 2019. Triclosan: an update on biochemical and molecular mechanisms. Oxid. Med. Cell. Longev. 2019, 1607304.
- Allmyr, M., Adolfsson-Erici, M., McLachlan, M.S., et al., 2006. Triclosan in plasma and milk from Swedish nursing mothers and their exposure via personal care products. Sci. Total Environ. 372, 87–93.
- Allmyr, M., Harden, F., Toms, L.M.L., et al., 2008. The influence of age and gender on triclosan concentrations in Australian human blood serum. Sci. Total Environ. 393, 162–167.
- Amigun Taiwo, A., Mustapha, S., Jimoh Oladejo, T., et al., 2022. Occurrence, effects, detection, and photodegradation of triclosan and triclocarban in the environment: a review. Int. J. Environ. Anal. Chem. 1–19.
- Ao, J., Yuan, T., Ma, Y., et al., 2017. Identification, characteristics and human exposure assessments of triclosan, bisphenol-A, and four commonly used organic UV filters in indoor dust collected from Shanghai, China. Chemosphere 184, 575–583.

Ashrap, P., Zheng, G., Wan, Y., et al., 2017. Discovery of a widespread metabolic pathway within and among phenolic xenobiotics. PNAS 114, 6062–6067.

Bagley, D.M., Lin, Y.J., 2000. Clinical evidence for the lack of triclosan accumulation from daily use in dentifrices. Am. J. Dent. 13, 148–152.

Balmer, M.E., Poiger, T., Droz, C., et al., 2004. Occurrence of Methyl Triclosan, a Transformation Product of the Bactericide Triclosan, in Fish from Various Lakes in Switzerland. Environ. Sci. Tech. 38, 390–395.

- Bedoux, G., Roig, B., Thomas, O., et al., 2012. Occurrence and toxicity of antimicrobial triclosan and by-products in the environment. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 19, 1044–1065.
- Berg, D., 2006. Patientensicherheit, Arzthaftung, Praxis- und Krankenhausorganisation. In: Berg, D., Ulsenheimer, K. (Eds.), Berlin. Heidelberg.
- Berger, K., Gunier, R.B., Chevrier, J., et al., 2018. Associations of maternal exposure to triclosan, parabens, and other phenols with prenatal maternal and neonatal thyroid hormone levels. Environ. Res. 165, 379–386.
- Binelli, A., Cogni, D., Parolini, M., et al., 2009. In vivo experiments for the evaluation of genotoxic and cytotoxic effects of Triclosan in Zebra mussel hemocytes. Aquat. Toxicol. 91, 238–244.
- Braun, J.M., Chen, A., Hoofnagle, A., et al., 2018. Associations of early life urinary triclosan concentrations with maternal, neonatal, and child thyroid hormone levels. Horm. Behav. 101, 77–84.
- Buth, J.M., Grandbois, M., Vikesland, P.J., et al., 2009. Aquatic photochemistry of chlorinated triclosan derivatives: Potential source of polychlorodibenzo-P-dioxins. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 28, 2555–2563.
- Buth, J.M., Steen, P.O., Sueper, C., et al., 2010. Dioxin photoproducts of triclosan and its chlorinated derivatives in sediment cores. Environ. Sci. Tech. 44, 4545–4551.
- Cai, S., Zhu, J., Sun, L., et al., 2019. Association between urinary triclosan with bone mass density and osteoporosis in US adult women, 2005–2010. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 104, 4531–4538.
- Canosa, P., Rodríguez, I., Rubí, E., et al., 2007. Determination of parabens and triclosan in indoor dust using matrix solid-phase dispersion and gas chromatography with tandem mass spectrometry. Anal. Chem. 79, 1675–1681.
- Capdevielle, M., Van Egmond, R., Whelan, M., et al., 2008. Consideration of exposure and species sensitivity of triclosan in the freshwater environment. Integr. Environ. Assess. Manag. 4, 15–23.
- Chen, J., Ahn, K.C., Gee, N.A., et al., 2007. Antiandrogenic properties of parabens and other phenolic containing small molecules in personal care products. Toxicol. Appl. Pharmacol. 221, 278–284.
- Chen, R., Liu, C., Yuan, L., et al., 2016. 2, 4-Dichloro-6-nitrophenol, a photonitration product of 2, 4-dichlorophenol, caused anti-androgenic potency in Chinese rare minnows (Gobiocypris rarus). Environ. Pollut. 216, 591–598.
- Chen, X., Nielsen, J.L., Furgal, K., et al., 2011. Biodegradation of triclosan and formation of methyl-triclosan in activated sludge under aerobic conditions. Chemosphere 84, 452–456.
- Chen, J., Xie, P., Wu, P., et al., 2023. Spatial metabolomics and lipidomics reveal the mechanisms of the enhanced growth of breast cancer cell spheroids exposed to triclosan. Environ. Sci. Tech. 57, 10542–10553.
- Chen, R., Yuan, L., Zha, J., et al., 2017. Developmental toxicity and thyroid hormonedisrupting effects of 2,4-dichloro-6-nitrophenol in Chinese rare minnow (Gobiocypris rarus). Aquat. Toxicol. 185, 40–47.
- Chirani, M.R., Kowsari, E., Teymourian, T., et al., 2021. Environmental impact of increased soap consumption during COVID-19 pandemic: Biodegradable soap production and sustainable packaging. Sci. Total Environ. 796, 149013.
- Choi, K., Sim, S., Choi, J., et al., 2021. Changes in handwashing and hygiene product usage patterns in Korea before and after the outbreak of COVID-19. Environ. Sci. Eur. 33, 79.
- Claus, S.P., Guillou, H., Ellero-Simatos, S., 2016. The gut microbiota: a major player in the toxicity of environmental pollutants? npj Biofilms Microbiomes 2, 16003.
- Cochran, K.H., Westerman, D.C., Montagner, C.C., et al., 2024. Chlorination of emerging contaminants for application in potable wastewater reuse: disinfection byproduct formation, estrogen activity, and cytotoxicity. Environ. Sci. Tech. 58, 704–716.
- Coogan, M.A., Edzivie, R.E., La Point, T.W., et al., 2007. Algal bioaccumulation of triclocarban, triclosan, and methyl-triclosan in a North Texas wastewater treatment plant receiving stream. Chemosphere 67, 1911–1918.
- Dann, A.B., Hontela, A., 2011. Triclosan: environmental exposure, toxicity and mechanisms of action. J. Appl. Toxicol. 31, 285–311.
- Dar, O.I., Aslam, R., Pan, D., et al., 2022. Source, bioaccumulation, degradability and toxicity of triclosan in aquatic environments: a review. Environ. Technol. Innov. 25, 102122.
- Dayan, A.D., 2007. Risk assessment of triclosan [Irgasan®] in human breast milk. Food Chem. Toxicol. 45, 125–129.
- Derakhshan, A., Shu, H., Peeters, R.P., et al., 2019. Association of urinary bisphenols and triclosan with thyroid function during early pregnancy. Environ. Int. 133, 105123.
- Derouiche, S., Mariot, P., Warnier, M., et al., 2017. Activation of TRPA1 channel by antibacterial agent triclosan induces VEGF secretion in human prostate cancer stromal cells. Cancer Prev. Res. 10, 177–187.
- DeSalva, S.J., Kong, B.M., Lin, Y.J., 1989. Triclosan: a safety profile. Am. J. Dent 2 Spec. No, 185–196.
- Dhama, K., Patel, S.K., Kumar, R., et al., 2021. The role of disinfectants and sanitizers during COVID-19 pandemic: advantages and deleterious effects on humans and the environment. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 28, 34211–34228.
- Dhillon, G.S., Kaur, S., Pulicharla, R., et al., 2015. Triclosan: current status, occurrence, environmental risks and bioaccumulation potential. Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 12, 5657–5684.
- Rees Clayton Erin, M.; Todd, M.; Dowd Jennifer, B., et al., 2011. The Impact of Bisphenol A and Triclosan on Immune Parameters in the U.S. Population, NHANES 2003–2006. Environ. Health Perspect. 119, 390–396.
- Etzel, T.M., Calafat, A.M., Ye, X., et al., 2017. Urinary triclosan concentrations during pregnancy and birth outcomes. Environ. Res. 156, 505–511.
- Fan, X., Kubwabo, C., Rasmussen, P., et al., 2010. Simultaneous quantitation of parabens, triclosan, and methyl triclosan in indoor house dust using solid phase extraction and gas chromatography-mass spectrometry. J Environ Monitor 12, 1891–1897.

N. Luo et al.

Fang, J.L., Stingley, R.L., Beland, F.A., et al., 2010. Occurrence, efficacy, metabolism, and toxicity of triclosan. J. Environ. Sci. Health C Environ. Carcinog. Ecotoxicol. Rev. 28, 147–171.

Fang, J.L., Vanlandingham, M., da Costa, G.G., et al., 2014. Absorption and metabolism of triclosan after application to the skin of B6C3F1 mice. Environ. Toxicol. 31, 609–623.

- Farré, M., Asperger, D., Kantiani, L., et al., 2008. Assessment of the acute toxicity of triclosan and methyl triclosan in wastewater based on the bioluminescence inhibition of Vibrio fischeri. Anal. Bioanal. Chem. 390, 1999–2007.
- Ferreiro, C., Sanz, J., Villota, N., et al., 2021. Kinetic modelling for concentration and toxicity changes during the oxidation of 4-chlorophenol by UV/H2O2. Sci. Rep. 11, 15726.
- Fields, B.S., Benson, R.F., Besser, R.E., 2002. Legionella and Legionnaires' disease: 25 years of investigation. Clin. Microbiol. Rev. 15, 506–526.
- Fiss, E.M., Rule, K.L., Vikesland, P.J., 2007. Formation of chloroform and other chlorinated byproducts by chlorination of triclosan-containing antibacterial products. Environ. Sci. Tech. 41, 2387–2394.

Frederiksen, H., Ljubicic, M.L., Upners, E.N., et al., 2022. Benzophenones, bisphenols and other polychlorinated/phenolic substances in Danish infants and their parents – including longitudinal assessments before and after introduction to mixed diet. Environ. Int. 169, 107532.

- Friedman, C.L., Cantwell, M.G., Lohmann, R., 2012. Passive sampling provides evidence for Newark Bay as a source of polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and furans to the New York/New Jersey, USA, atmosphere. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 31, 253–261.
- Gao, Y., Ji, Y., Li, G., et al., 2014. Mechanism, kinetics and toxicity assessment of OHinitiated transformation of triclosan in aquatic environments. Water Res. 49, 360–370.
- Gao, Y., Niu, X., Wang, M., et al., 2021. An inescapable fact: Toxicity increase during photo-driven degradation of emerging contaminants in water environments. Curr Opin Green Sust 30, 100472.
- Gaume, B., Bourgougnon, N., Auzoux-Bordenave, S., et al., 2012. In vitro effects of triclosan and methyl-triclosan on the marine gastropod Haliotis tuberculata. Comp. Biochem. Physiol. C: Toxicol. Pharmacol. 156, 87–94.
- Geens, T., Roosens, L., Neels, H., et al., 2009. Assessment of human exposure to Bisphenol-A, Triclosan and Tetrabromobisphenol-A through indoor dust intake in Belgium. Chemosphere 76, 755–760.
- Geens, T., Neels, H., Covaci, A., 2012. Distribution of bisphenol-A, triclosan and nnonylphenol in human adipose tissue, liver and brain. Chemosphere 87, 796–802.
- Ginsberg, G., Rice Deborah, C., 2009. Does rapid metabolism ensure negligible risk from bisphenol A? Environ. Health Perspect. 117, 1639–1643.
- Goodman, M., Naiman, D.Q., LaKind, J.S., 2018. Systematic review of the literature on triclosan and health outcomes in humans. Crit. Rev. Toxicol. 48, 1–51.
- Guengerich, F.P., 2017. Intersection of the roles of cytochrome P450 enzymes with xenobiotic and endogenous substrates: relevance to toxicity and drug interactions. Chem. Res. Toxicol. 30, 2–12.
- Guo, J., Wu, C., Zhang, J., et al., 2020a. Maternal and childhood urinary phenol concentrations, neonatal thyroid function, and behavioral problems at 10 years of age: The SMBCS study. Sci. Total Environ. 743, 140678.
- Guo, J., Wu, C., Zhang, J., et al., 2020b. Early life triclosan exposure and neurodevelopment of children at 3 years in a prospective birth cohort. Int. J. Hyg. Environ. Health 224, 113427.
- Halden Rolf, U., Lindeman Avery, E., Aiello Allison, E., et al., 2017. The florence statement on triclosan and triclocarban. Environ. Health Perspect. 125, 064501.
- Hamers, T., Kortenkamp, A., Scholze, M., et al., 2020. Transthyretin-binding activity of complex mixtures representing the composition of thyroid-hormone disrupting contaminants in house dust and human serum. Environ. Health Perspect. 128, 017015.
- Han, C., Lim, Y.H., Hong, Y.C., 2016. Ten-year trends in urinary concentrations of triclosan and benzophenone-3 in the general U.S. population from 2003 to 2012. Environ. Pollut. 208, 803–810.
- Hartmann, E.M., Hickey, R., Hsu, T., et al., 2016. Antimicrobial chemicals are associated with elevated antibiotic resistance genes in the indoor dust microbiome. Environ. Sci. Tech. 50, 9807–9815.
- Huang, H., Du, G., Zhang, W., et al., 2014. The in Vitro estrogenic activities of triclosan and triclocarban. J. Appl. Toxicol. 34, 1060–1067.
- Huang, W., Xie, P., Cai, Z., 2020. Lipid metabolism disorders contribute to hepatotoxicity of triclosan in mice. J. Hazard. Mater. 384, 121310.
- Huo, W., Xia, W., Wu, C., et al., 2018. Urinary level of triclosan in a population of Chinese pregnant women and its association with birth outcomes. Environ. Pollut. 233, 872–879.
- Iovino, P., Chianese, S., Prisciandaro, M., et al., 2019. Triclosan photolysis: operating condition study and photo-oxidation pathway. Chem. Eng. J. 377, 121045.
- Kawanai, T., 2011. Triclosan, an environmental pollutant from health care products, evokes charybdotoxin-sensitive hyperpolarization in rat thymocytes. Environ. Toxicol. Pharmacol. 32, 417–422.
- Kenda, M., Karas Kuželički, N., Iida, M., et al., 2020. Triclocarban, triclosan, bromochlorophene, chlorophene, and climbazole effects on nuclear receptors: an in silico and in vitro study. Environ. Health Perspect. 128, 107005.
- Kim, J.H., Kim, D., Moon, S.M., et al., 2020. Associations of lifestyle factors with phthalate metabolites, bisphenol A, parabens, and triclosan concentrations in breast milk of Korean mothers. Chemosphere 249, 126149.
- Kim, K., Park, H., Yang, W., et al., 2011. Urinary concentrations of bisphenol A and triclosan and associations with demographic factors in the Korean population. Environ. Res. 111, 1280–1285.

- Kim, K., Shin, H.M., Busgang, S.A., et al., 2021. Temporal trends of phenol, paraben, and triclocarban exposure in california pregnant women during 2007–2014. Environ. Sci. Tech. 55, 11155–11165.
- Kolšek, K., Gobec, M., Mlinarič Raščan, I., et al., 2015. Screening of bisphenol A, triclosan and paraben analogues as modulators of the glucocorticoid and androgen receptor activities. Toxicol Vitro 29, 8–15.
- Krause, M., Klit, A., Blomberg Jensen, M., et al., 2012. Sunscreens: are they beneficial for health? An overview of endocrine disrupting properties of UV-filters. Int. J. Androl. 35, 424–436.
- Kumar, S., Paul, T., Shukla, S.P., et al., 2021. Biomarkers-based assessment of triclosan toxicity in aquatic environment: a mechanistic review. Environ. Pollut. 286, 117569.
- Kumar, K.S., Priya, S.M., Peck, A.M., et al., 2010. Mass loadings of triclosan and triclocarbon from four wastewater treatment plants to three rivers and landfill in Savannah, Georgia, USA. Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 58, 275–285.
- Laborie, S., Moreau-Guigon, E., Alliot, F., et al., 2016. A new analytical protocol for the determination of 62 endocrine-disrupting compounds in indoor air. Talanta 147, 132–141.
- Lalonde, B., Garron, C., Dove, A., et al., 2019. Investigation of spatial distributions and temporal trends of triclosan in canadian surface waters. Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 76, 231–245.
- Lassen, T.H., Frederiksen, H., Kyhl, H.B., et al., 2016. Prenatal triclosan exposure and anthropometric measures including anogenital distance in Danish infants. Environ. Health Perspect. 124, 1261–1268.
- Laue, H.E., Gilmour, A.J., Tirado, V.M., et al., 2024. Conceptualizing the role of the microbiome as a mediator and modifier in environmental health studies: a scoping review of studies of triclosan and the microbiome. Current Environm. Health Rep. 11, 30–38.
- Lee, J.-S., Lee, J.-S., Kim, H.S., 2024. Toxic effects of triclosan in aquatic organisms: a review focusing on single and combined exposure of environmental conditions and pollutants. Sci. Total Environ. 920, 170902.
- Li, M., He, Y., Sun, J., et al., 2019. Chronic exposure to an environmentally relevant triclosan concentration induces persistent triclosan resistance but reversible antibiotic tolerance in escherichia coli. Environ. Sci. Tech. 53, 3277–3286.
- Li, S., Zhao, J., Wang, G., et al., 2015. Urinary triclosan concentrations are inversely associated with body mass index and waist circumference in the US general population: Experience in NHANES 2003–2010. Int. J. Hyg. Environ. Health 218, 401–406.
- Liu, L., Cui, H., Huang, Y., et al., 2022. Enzyme-mediated reactions of phenolic pollutants and endogenous metabolites as an overlooked metabolic disruption pathway. Environ. Sci. Tech. 56, 3634–3644.
- Liu, M., Li, N., Zhang, Y., et al., 2020. Characterization of covalent protein modification by triclosan in vivo and in vitro via three-dimensional liquid chromatography-mass spectrometry: New insight into its adverse effects. Environ. Int. 136, 105423.
- Lozano, N., Rice, C.P., Ramirez, M., et al., 2012. Fate of Triclosan and Methyltriclosan in soil from biosolids application. Environ. Pollut. 160, 103–108.
- Lozano, N., Rice, C.P., Ramirez, M., et al., 2013. Fate of Triclocarban, Triclosan and Methyltriclosan during wastewater and biosolids treatment processes. Water Res. 47, 4519–4527.
- Lu, J., Wang, Y., Li, J., et al., 2018. Triclosan at environmentally relevant concentrations promotes horizontal transfer of multidrug resistance genes within and across bacterial genera. Environ. Int. 121, 1217–1226.
- Lu, J., Wang, Y., Zhang, S., et al., 2020. Triclosan at environmental concentrations can enhance the spread of extracellular antibiotic resistance genes through transformation. Sci. Total Environ. 713, 136621.
- Lu, J., Yu, Z., Ding, P., et al., 2022. Triclosan promotes conjugative transfer of antibiotic resistance genes to opportunistic pathogens in environmental microbiome. Environ. Sci. Tech. 56, 15108–15119.
- Ma, J., Zhu, C., Lu, J., et al., 2017. Photochemical reaction between triclosan and nitrous acid in the atmospheric aqueous environment. Atmos. Environ. 157, 38–48.
- Macedo, S., Torres, T., Santos, M.M., 2017. Methyl-triclosan and triclosan impact embryonic development of Danio rerio and Paracentrotus lividus. Ecotoxicology 26, 482–489.
- Macherius, A., Eggen, T., Lorenz, W., et al., 2012. Metabolization of the bacteriostatic agent triclosan in edible plants and its consequences for plant uptake assessment. Environ. Sci. Tech. 46, 10797–10804.
- Maharana, D., Niu, J., Rao, N.N., et al., 2015. Electrochemical degradation of triclosan at a Ti/SnO2-Sb/Ce-PbO2 Anode. Clean (Weinh) 43, 958–966.
- Marinković, N., Pašalić, D., Ferenčak, G., et al., 2010. Dioxins and Human Toxicity. Arh. Hig. Rada Toksikol. 61, 445–453.
- Martin, E.K., Kemal, S., Henrik, N.R., et al., 2020. Triclosan changes community composition and selects for specific bacterial taxa in marine periphyton biofilms in low nanomolar concentrations. Ecotoxicology 29, 1083–1094.
- Mezcua, M., Gómez, M.J., Ferrer, I., et al., 2004. Evidence of 2,7/2,8-dibenzodichloro-pdioxin as a photodegradation product of triclosan in water and wastewater samples. Anal. Chim. Acta 524, 241–247.
- Milanović, M., Đurić, L., Milošević, N., et al., 2023. Comprehensive insight into triclosan—from widespread occurrence to health outcomes. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 30, 25119–25140.
- Montaseri, H., Forbes, P.B.C., 2016. A review of monitoring methods for triclosan and its occurrence in aquatic environments. Trends Analyt Chem 85, 221–231.
- Mukherjee, S., Boral, S., Siddiqi, H., et al., 2021. Present cum future of SARS-CoV-2 virus and its associated control of virus-laden air pollutants leading to potential environmental threat – A global review. J. Environ. Chem. Eng. 9, 104973.
- Neel, B.A., Sargis, R.M., 2011. The paradox of progress: environmental disruption of metabolism and the diabetes epidemic. Diabetes 60, 1838–1848.

N. Luo et al.

Okada, H., Kuhn, C., Feillet, H., et al., 2010. The 'hygiene hypothesis' for autoimmune and allergic diseases: an update. Clin. Exp. Immunol. 160, 1–9.

Patti, M.A., Henderson, N.B., Gajjar, P., et al., 2021. Gestational triclosan exposure and infant birth weight: A systematic review and meta-analysis. Environ. Int. 157, 106854

- Paul, K.B., Hedge, J.M., DeVito, M.J., et al., 2010. Short-term exposure to triclosan decreases thyroxine in vivo via upregulation of hepatic catabolism in young longevans rats. Toxicol. Sci. 113, 367–379.
- Paul, K.B., Hedge, J.M., Bansal, R., et al., 2012. Developmental triclosan exposure decreases maternal, fetal, and early neonatal thyroxine: a dynamic and kinetic evaluation of a putative mode-of-action. Toxicology 300, 31–45.
- Peng, B., Liu, M., Han, Y., et al., 2019. Competitive biotransformation among phenolic xenobiotic mixtures: underestimated risks for toxicity assessment. Environ. Sci. Tech. 53, 12081–12090.
- Pirard, C., Sagot, C., Deville, M., et al., 2012. Urinary levels of bisphenol A, triclosan and 4-nonylphenol in a general Belgian population. Environ. Int. 48, 78–83.
- Provencher, G., Bérubé, R., Dumas, P., et al., 2014. Determination of bisphenol A, triclosan and their metabolites in human urine using isotope-dilution liquid chromatography-tandem mass spectrometry. J. Chromatogr. A 1348, 97–104.
- Rehman, S.U., Shafqa, F., Usman, M., et al., 2021. Triclosan Induced Oxidative Stress, Estrogenicity, Mutagenicity, Carcinogenicity, and Genotoxicity: A Novel Therapeutic Approach. Biomed Res Ther 8, 4750–4774.
- Rodricks, J.V., Swenberg, J.A., Borzelleca, J.F., et al., 2010. Triclosan: A critical review of the experimental data and development of margins of safety for consumer products. Crit. Rev. Toxicol. 40, 422–484.
- Rodríguez, P.E.A., Sanchez, M.S., 2010. Maternal Exposure to Triclosan Impairs Thyroid Homeostasis and Female Pubertal Development in Wistar Rat Offspring. J. Toxicol. Environ. Health Part A 73, 1678–1688.
- Sanchez-Prado, L., Llompart, M., Lores, M., et al., 2006. Monitoring the photochemical degradation of triclosan in wastewater by UV light and sunlight using solid-phase microextraction. Chemosphere 65, 1338–1347.
- Sandborgh-Englund, G., Adolfsson-Erici, M., Odham, G., et al., 2006. Pharmacokinetics of triclosan following oral ingestion in humans. J. Toxicol. Environ. Health Part A 69, 1861–1873.
- Savage, J.H., Matsui, E.C., Wood, R.A., et al., 2012. Urinary levels of triclosan and parabens are associated with aeroallergen and food sensitization. J. Allergy Clin. Immunol. 130, 453–460.e457.
- Siddiqui, W.H., Buttar, H.S., 1979. Pharmacokinetics of triclosan in rat after intravenous and intravaginal administration. J. Environ. Pathol. Toxicol. 2, 861–871.
- Skarha, J., Mínguez-Alarcón, L., Williams, P.L., et al., 2019. Cross-sectional associations between urinary triclosan and serum thyroid function biomarker concentrations in women. Environ. Int. 122, 256–262.
- Solá-Gutiérrez, C., San Román, M.F., Ortiz, I., 2018. Fate and hazard of the electrochemical oxidation of triclosan. Evaluation of polychlorodibenzo-p-dioxins and polychlorodibenzofurans (PCDD/Fs) formation. Sci. Total Environ. 626, 126–133.
- Solá-Gutiérrez, C., Schröder, S., San-Román, M.F., et al., 2020. Critical review on the mechanistic photolytic and photocatalytic degradation of triclosan. J. Environ. Manage. 260, 110101.
- Spanier, A.J., Fausnight, T., Camacho, T.F., et al., 2014. The associations of triclosan and paraben exposure with allergen sensitization and wheeze in children. Allergy Asthma Proc. 35, 475–481.
- Tian, X., Huang, K., Liu, Y., et al., 2023. Distribution of phthalate metabolites, benzophenone-type ultraviolet filters, parabens, triclosan and triclocarban in paired human hair, nail and urine samples. Environ. Pollut. 333, 122083.
- Tohidi, F., Cai, Z., 2017. Fate and mass balance of triclosan and its degradation products: Comparison of three different types of wastewater treatments and aerobic/anaerobic sludge digestion. J. Hazard. Mater. 323, 329–340.
- Tran, T.M., Trinh, H.T., Anh, H.Q., et al., 2020. Characterization of triclosan and triclocarban in indoor dust from home micro-environments in Vietnam and relevance of non-dietary exposure. Sci. Total Environ. 732, 139326.
- Tsai, S.W., Shih, M.W., Pan, Y.P., 2008. Determinations and residual characteristics of triclosan in household food detergents of Taiwan. Chemosphere 72, 1250–1255.

Wang, C., Chen, L., Zhao, S., et al., 2018. Impacts of prenatal triclosan exposure on fetal reproductive hormones and its potential mechanism. Environ. Int. 111, 279–286.

- Wang, L.-Q., Falany, C.N., James, M.O., 2004. Triclosan as a substrate and inhibitor of 3'phosphoadenosine 5'-phosphosulfate-sulfotransferase and UDP-glucuronosyl transferase in human liver fractions. Drug Metab. Dispos. 32, 1162.
- Wang, M., Hu, B., Zhou, W., et al., 2022. Enhanced hand-to-mouth exposure from hand sanitizers during the COVID-19 pandemic: a case study of triclosan. Sci. Bull. 67, 995–998.
- Wang, C.F., Tian, Y., 2015. Reproductive endocrine-disrupting effects of triclosan: Population exposure, present evidence and potential mechanisms. Environ. Pollut. 206, 195–201.
- Weatherly, L.M., Gosse, J.A., 2017. Triclosan exposure, transformation, and human health effects. J. Toxicol. Environ. Health B Crit. Rev. 20, 447–469.
- Wei, L., Qiao, P., Shi, Y., et al., 2017. Triclosan/triclocarban levels in maternal and umbilical blood samples and their association with fetal malformation. Clin. Chim. Acta 466, 133–137.
- Wolff Mary, S., Teitelbaum Susan, L., Pinney Susan, M., et al., 2010. Investigation of Relationships between Urinary Biomarkers of Phytoestrogens, Phthalates, and Phenols and Pubertal Stages in Girls. Environ. Health Perspect. 118, 1039–1046.
- Wu, Y., Chitranshi, P., Loukotková, L., et al., 2017. Cytochrome P450-mediated metabolism of triclosan attenuates its cytotoxicity in hepatic cells. Arch. Toxicol. 91, 2405–2423.
- Wu, J.-L., Ji, F., Zhang, H., et al., 2019. Formation of dioxins from triclosan with active chlorine: A potential risk assessment. J. Hazard. Mater. 367, 128–136.
- Wu, C., Spongberg, A.L., Witter, J.D., et al., 2010. Uptake of Pharmaceutical and Personal Care Products by Soybean Plants from Soils Applied with Biosolids and Irrigated with Contaminated Water. Environ. Sci. Tech. 44, 6157–6161.
- Wu, C., Li, J., Xia, W., et al., 2018. The association of repeated measurements of prenatal exposure to triclosan with fetal and early-childhood growth. Environ. Int. 120, 54–62.
- Yin, J., Wei, L., Shi, Y., et al., 2016. Chinese population exposure to triclosan and triclocarban as measured via human urine and nails. Environ. Geochem. Health 38, 1125–1135.
- Yin, Y., Wu, H., Jiang, Z., et al., 2022. Degradation of Triclosan in the Water Environment by Microorganisms: A Review. Microorganisms 10, 1713.
- Yueh, M.-F., Taniguchi, K., Chen, S., et al., 2014. The commonly used antimicrobial additive triclosan is a liver tumor promoter. PNAS 111, 17200–17205.
- Zhang, H., Li, J., Chen, Y., et al., 2021a. Profiles of parabens, benzophenone-type ultraviolet filters, triclosan, and triclocarban in paired urine and indoor dust samples from Chinese university students: implications for human exposure. Sci. Total Environ. 798, 149275.
- Zhang, D., Lu, S., 2023. A holistic review on triclosan and triclocarban exposure: Epidemiological outcomes, antibiotic resistance, and health risk assessment. Sci. Total Environ. 872, 162114.
- Zhang, H., Shao, X., Zhao, H., et al., 2019. Integration of Metabolomics and Lipidomics Reveals Metabolic Mechanisms of Triclosan-Induced Toxicity in Human Hepatocytes. Environ. Sci. Tech. 53, 5406–5415.
- Zhang, H., Sanidad, K.Z., Zhu, L., et al., 2021b. Frequent occurrence of triclosan hydroxylation in mammals: A combined theoretical and experimental investigation. J. Hazard. Mater. 407, 124803.

Zhang, H., Sanidad, K.Z., Zhang, J., et al., 2023. Microbiota-mediated reactivation of triclosan oxidative metabolites in colon tissues. J. Hazard. Mater. 445, 130509.

Zhang, J., Walker, M.E., Sanidad, K.Z., et al., 2022. Microbial enzymes induce colitis by reactivating triclosan in the mouse gastrointestinal tract. Nat. Commun. 13, 136.

- Zhao, J.-L., Zhang, Q.-Q., Chen, F., et al., 2013. Evaluation of triclosan and triclocarban at river basin scale using monitoring and modeling tools: Implications for controlling of urban domestic sewage discharge. Water Res. 47, 395–405.
- Zheng, G.J., Leung, A.O., Jiao, L.P., et al., 2008. Polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans pollution in China: sources, environmental levels and potential human health impacts. Environ. Int. 34, 1050–1061.

Zhu, L., Shao, Y., Xiao, H., et al., 2018. Electrochemical simulation of triclosan

metabolism and toxicological evaluation. Sci. Total Environ. 622–623, 1193–1201. Zorrilla, L.M., Gibson, E.K., Jeffay, S.C., et al., 2009. The effects of triclosan on puberty and thyroid hormones in male wistar rats. Toxicol. Sci. 107, 56–64.